



Request for Proposals (RFP) for NOACA Building Mural Project

Issue Date: Friday, March 22, 2024
Closing Date: Friday, April 19, 2024

1299 Superior Avenue
Cleveland, Ohio 44114-3204
(216) 241-2414, ext. 108
www.noaca.org

Table of Contents

1. NORTHEAST OHIO AREAWIDE COORDINATING AGENCY (NOACA)	3
2. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	4
3. SCOPE OF WORK	4
4. QUALIFICATIONS	5
5. PROCUREMENT TIMELINE	5
6. REQUIREMENTS FOR PROPOSALS.....	6
7. EVALUATION CRITERIA AND PROCEDURES.....	8
8. ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES AND CONDITIONS.....	10
9. QUESTIONS	10
Exhibit A - Example Table of Deliverables.....	11
Exhibit B - Pricing Proposal	12
Exhibit C - Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension & Other Responsibility Matters.....	14

1. NORTHEAST OHIO AREAWIDE COORDINATING AGENCY (NOACA)

The Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency (NOACA) is a Cleveland-based transportation and environmental planning organization that serves as the metropolitan planning organization (MPO) and designated areawide water quality management agency for the counties of Cuyahoga, Geauga, Lake, Lorain, and Medina in Ohio.

In these capacities it:

- Works with other organizations to help address northeast Ohio's transportation, air quality, and water quality needs
- Conducts metropolitan planning for various modes of transportation, including vehicles, freight, transit, bicycle, pedestrian, etc., while considering the transportation system's impact on the environment and land use
- Prepares the region's long-range transportation plan and short-range transportation improvement program, which is the region's capital budget for federally funded transportation projects
- Conducts studies that address congestion, improve safety and strengthen community livability

The vision of NOACA is as follows: NOACA will **STRENGTHEN** regional cohesion, **PRESERVE** existing infrastructure, and **BUILD** a sustainable multimodal transportation system to **SUPPORT** economic development and **ENHANCE** quality of life in Northeast Ohio.

NOACA is directed by a 48-member Board of Directors, representing the City of Cleveland and all five NOACA counties and their communities, plus transit agencies, the Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District (NEORS), the Cleveland-Cuyahoga County Port Authority, the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency (Ohio EPA), the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT), and the Ohio Turnpike Infrastructure Commission.

The NOACA region is home to 2.1 million people and over 150 units of government. The region is anchored by several urban core cities with the largest being Cleveland.

More information about NOACA is available on our website at www.noaca.org.

2. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

NOACA (“Client”) is currently seeking the professional services of an organization (“Vendor”) to manage and implement installation of a painted mural on the exterior of its building located at 1299 Superior Avenue in downtown Cleveland, Ohio.

Through this project, NOACA seeks to leverage the building’s exterior as a public reflection of its work; to educate the community about NOACA’s role as Metropolitan Planning Organization and Areawide agency; and to enhance the appearance of the urban landscape for people who live in, work in, and visit the neighborhood.

The NOACA Mural project also relates to the agency’s “Net Zero Cool” project, which was launched in 2020 and consists of the installation at its property of multi-phased green infrastructure, including a green wall and educational signage.

3. SCOPE OF WORK

Under this RFP, the selected Vendor shall develop and execute a project management plan that results in the installation of a mural on the east and north walls of NOACA’s building. The selected Vendor shall have the project completed by Fall of 2024.

The project space on the east side of the building measures three-stories tall by approximately 158 feet in length. The project space on the north side of the building measures three-stories tall by approximately 78 feet in length. Components of the project management plan should include the following deliverables, in addition to any other activities the Vendor believes are essential to successful implementation.

- Assist Client with development of mural’s artistic theme(s)
- Develop and execute call-for-artist process**
- Assist Client with selection of artist
- Secure any project approval(s) and/or permit(s) needed from the City of Cleveland to proceed with work
- Contract for any necessary preparation of project surface area
- Contract with selected artist
- Manage mural installation process, including, but not limited to the following activities:
 - Develop and execute a safety plan for right-of-way (sidewalk) access for public along East 13th Street during installation that is compliant with City of Cleveland safety regulations
 - Develop and execute a safety plan for building and parking lot access to north side of facility for employees and visitors during installation
 - Rental of equipment
 - Purchase of materials
 - Preparation of project surface area in a manner that is environmentally compliant with industry standards and government regulations
 - Installation of artwork

*** Call-for-artist process is to be conducted by Vendor in a manner that is transparent, fair and open to the public and shall not place qualifications on participation such as residence, Vendor-artist contractual relationship, or other factors. Call-for-artist process shall not discriminate against participants based on race, color, religion, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, or national origin.*

4. QUALIFICATIONS

The selected Vendor (or any of the selected Vendor's subcontractors) cannot currently, or at the time of contracting, be listed on any federal, state, or local government jurisdiction debarment or suspension lists.

NOACA is seeking a Vendor with experience and a proven track record in successful execution of public art projects, specifically murals. Potential Vendors shall demonstrate they have the capability and resources needed to support Client and manage the project across the full spectrum of activities necessary for successful implementation – from concept development to local government approval, to artist selection and management, through installation.

5. PROCUREMENT TIMELINE

NOACA's process and *estimated* timeline for the selection of a consultant are as follows:

April 19, 2024, 5:00 p.m. – Deadline for RFP Submittals

Proposals shall be submitted in PDF via email to procurement@mpo.noaca.org. NOACA assumes no responsibility for formatting or transmission errors. Submittals received after the deadline will not be considered. Please reference "NOACA Mural Project" in the email subject line.

April 2024 – Consideration of Proposals

An evaluation team will select candidate Vendor(s) from proposals received. This process will include review and scoring of proposals, and review of references and other information as necessary. At the end of this process, NOACA will select the proposal it considers the most highly qualified, price and all other factors considered.

June 2024 – If needed¹, consideration of award by NOACA Board of Directors

May or June – Execution of contract between NOACA and Vendor

Summer 2024 – commence work

¹ Any award of contract that exceeds \$50,000 must be approved by the NOACA Board of Directors.

6. REQUIREMENTS FOR PROPOSALS

A. General Instructions

NOACA will not reimburse proposers for any costs incurred prior to execution of a contract, including, but not limited to the preparation and submittal of proposals or participation in the evaluation and negotiation process.

Proposals shall clearly address the evaluation criteria and information requested herein. Overly elaborate proposals and proposals containing only generalized marketing information are discouraged and may result in a lower evaluation score. No pricing or price-related information shall be included in the Technical Proposal (Volume I).

Firms included on the current Excluded Parties List System maintained within the System for Award Management by the United States General Services Administration, or on comparable lists of suspended or debarred firms maintained by the State of Ohio or jurisdictions within NOACA's service area, are not eligible for selection.

B. Requirements for Technical Proposal (Volume I)

The Technical Proposal shall include the following components:

1. A cover letter that identifies the prime consultant and any subcontractors known at the time of submittal. The cover letter shall identify the officer or other responsible executive of the organization authorized to negotiate and agree to a contract by name, title, address, telephone, and email. This individual, or a designee, shall serve as NOACA's point of contact for all communications regarding this solicitation. The letter should also contain a commitment that the proposed pricing will be valid for not less than 120 days.
2. A brief overview about the organization including location of office(s), number of years in operation and areas of service expertise.

Description of the proposer's approach to the project, including a detailed scope of services that reflects understanding of the objectives of the NOACA Mural Project. If appropriate, the proposer shall expand on the scope of work and provide suggestions that will enhance the outcomes of the project. This section should detail the tasks needed to accomplish all the objectives of the project, and an estimated timeline (in terms of weeks from contract execution) tied to the tasks in the scope of work. The project approach should highlight innovation and creativity, as appropriate. Provide a table, attached to the submission as Appendix A, that summarizes and breaks down the project's deliverables, percentage of work, and estimated time to complete. A table template is attached to this RFP as *Exhibit A*.

3. Description of methods to be utilized in monitoring performance and progress, and for reporting on status of project to client. Identify potential risks and how those risks will be prevented or mitigated.
4. Identification of key staff to be assigned to this project and the deliverables for which each individual will be responsible. Attach resumes that describe the education, experience and any professional certifications for each key staff person. Highlight experience and education relevant to the project. NOACA reserves the right to approve or reject any personnel assigned by the Vendor or subcontractors to this project.

5. Description of the capacity of Vendor to perform the work in a timely manner, relative to the organization's present workload and the availability of the assigned staff.
6. Listing of prior work on other projects that are similar in scope to the NOACA Mural project. Examples should describe the scope of work and demonstrate successful performance in project completion. The list of prior projects should include assignments undertaken in the past five (5) years and identify the duration of the project and the client. Provide contact information (name, title, organization, email, and telephone) for each client on prior work examples. NOACA may contact references as well as other resources to verify an organization's qualifications, experience, professionalism, and ability to perform the work. If any such projects were not satisfactorily completed, provide an explanation of the circumstances.
7. List of all known subcontractors, identifying those that are certified as Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBE) by the State of Ohio or another relevant agency with the authority to make such certification, along with the type and percentage of work to be performed by each subcontractor. Include description(s) of subcontractor(s) qualifications, identify key personnel, and provide contact person with respective email and telephone number for any subcontractor(s). NOACA reserves the right to approve or reject any subcontractors proposed by Vendor for this project.

C. Requirements for Business Proposal - Volume II

The Business Proposal shall include the following components:

1. A pricing proposal, to be included in the vendor's submission as Appendix B. The pricing proposal form is included in this RFP for illustration as Exhibit B and can be downloaded in editable form [at this link](#). In the pricing proposal, staff hourly rates should be broken down according to base hourly rate, overhead (%), burdened hourly rate, billing rate and – if applicable – profit. Direct costs such as travel expenses, fixed-price payments to subcontractors or other vendors, supplies, and equipment rental will be reimbursed at cost. NOACA will reimburse travel and living expenses only for travel more than 50 miles from the traveler's ordinary work location, at the rates specified in the General Services Administration's most current per diem rates for the locality involved.
2. Copies of the proposer's worker's compensation certificate for the jurisdiction where work will be performed and general liability, professional liability and automobile insurance certificate(s).
3. Completed form "Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension & Other Responsibility Matters," attached to this RFP as Exhibit C.

The proposer may identify any proposed exceptions to the instructions, terms and conditions as contained in this RFP or propose any additional terms it considers appropriate. Such proposed exceptions or additional terms be specific and include a clear explanation of the reasons for the exception or addition. Please note that certain terms contained herein are required by law or regulation and cannot be modified. Any inquiries or questions regarding proposed exceptions to this RFP should be submitted to procurement@mpo.noaca.org.

7. EVALUATION CRITERIA AND PROCEDURES

A. Evaluation Criteria

1. Experience/Qualifications (up to 30 points)

Each proposer will be evaluated regarding their experience and qualifications appropriate to the proposed project. Factors to consider include:

- i. Experience/qualifications facilitating artwork concept development
- ii. Experience/qualifications coordinating a call-for-artist and artist selection process
- iii. Experience/qualifications working with artists
- iv. Experience/qualifications working with local approval authority
- v. Experience/qualifications managing installation of all components of a large-scale mural

2. Project Approach (up to 40 points)

Each consultant will be evaluated based on the approach presented in the Technical Proposal to complete the project. Factors to consider include:

- i. Demonstration of understanding the goals and objectives of the proposed project
- ii. Quality and completeness of a projected table of deliverables included in the Technical Proposal, including identification of project components that will achieve the objectives of the project
- iii. Methods and strategies to best accomplish all deliverables of the project, including the proposed schedule.
- iv. Creativity and innovation

3. Project Management (up to 30 points)

Each consultant will be evaluated based on the presentation of a management plan that ensures services are successfully completed. Factors to consider include:

- i. Demonstration of effective project management on similar projects, resulting in the delivery of a high-quality work product
- ii. Demonstration of ability to meet deliverables according to defined timeline
- iii. Description of performance evaluation methodology that monitors for achievement of project goals and objectives throughout the duration of the project
- iv. Description of status reporting methodology
- v. Project approach that demonstrates how tasks or parts are coordinated, staffed, and completed
- vi. Identification of potential risks, and steps that can be taken to prevent or mitigate those risks

4. Project Budget and Cost (not scored)

Points are not awarded for this category, but NOACA may consider cost reasonableness during the evaluation process.

B. Evaluation Procedures

NOACA intends to award a contract to the Vendor whose proposal, including negotiated modifications, is considered to provide the best combination of technical quality and cost. A team comprised of NOACA staff will evaluate any proposals received by the deadline. The evaluation team will first evaluate the proposals according to the technical criteria stated above. NOACA may ask Vendors for clarification of their proposals, conduct interviews, or request that proposers give presentations. Such interviews may be conducted in person, by telephone or through video conference. If such interviews are held, the evaluation team will re-evaluate the proposals, at which time they may eliminate some Vendors from further consideration.

NOACA may negotiate with proposers that remain in the competitive range. Following such negotiations, NOACA may request that the remaining firms submit a best and final offer, which the team will evaluate. The team may then recommend that firm for award. Depending on Vendor's proposed cost, recommendation of award may be subject to final approval by the NOACA Board of Directors. Any contract that exceeds \$50,000 in cost is subject to Board approval.

NOACA reserves the right to accept proposals other than the lowest cost offered, reject any and all proposals, or to negotiate separately with any proposer or proposers as deemed to be in NOACA's best interest. NOACA also reserves the right to waive minor informalities, irregularities or errors which do not affect the substance of the proposal, or may award on the basis of initial proposals received without discussions or negotiations with proposers. The original proposal, therefore, should represent the Vendor's best effort to meet NOACA's needs at a reasonable price.

8. ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES AND CONDITIONS

- A. There is no Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) goal for this contract, but DBE-certified entities are encouraged to apply, and non-DBE entities are encouraged to subcontract a portion of work to firms certified as DBE by the [State of Ohio's Unified Certification Program](#). If a DBE-certified firm is the prime or sub-consultant, the pricing proposal should quantify the level of DBE participation as a percentage of the total contract.
- B. Consultants agree not to discriminate against any employee or applicant for employment because of race, color, religion, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, or national origin. Such action shall include, but not be limited to, the following: employment, upgrading, demotion or transfer, recruitment or recruitment advertising, layoff or termination; rates of pay or other forms of compensation; and selection for training, including apprenticeship. Consultants further agree to comply with all requirements of Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, 42 U.S.C. § 2000d et seq., 49 C.F.R. Part 21.
- C. The proposal, including price, shall be valid for at least 120 days from the date of submission.
- D. An RFP does not constitute an offer or a contract. No contract may be awarded without a resolution by the NOACA Board of Directors.
- E. NOACA reserves the right to amend, cancel or reissue the RFP or to revise the timeline at any time.
- F. NOACA reserves the right to reject any and all proposals and to waive minor irregularities in the proposal process. NOACA may accept any proposal if such action is believed to be in the best interest of the agency.
- G. NOACA is not liable for any cost incurred by the proposer prior to execution of a contract.
- H. The contract between the successful proposer and NOACA shall include all documents mutually entered into including the contract instrument, relevant portions of the RFP and the response to the RFP. The contract must include and be consistent with the provisions stated in the RFP, as may be modified by negotiations.
- I. The prime Vendor will assume the responsibility for all services offered in the proposal regardless of whether directly performed by the prime Vendor. Further, the prime Vendor will be the sole point of contact for NOACA regarding contractual matters.
- J. The consultant project team shall be approved by NOACA. NOACA must approve any changes in the project team.
- K. Any award of contract will be to the Vendor that provides the highest value relative to costs.

9. QUESTIONS

For questions regarding the RFP, please contact procurement@mpo.noaca.org. Submitting questions early in the process provides NOACA the opportunity to respond; questions received near the deadline may not receive a response. All answers will be publicly posted on [NOACA's website under About-Contact Us-Doing Business with NOACA](#).

Exhibit B - Pricing Proposal: Tab 1 "Staff and Direct Cost"

EXHIBIT B - PRICING							
STAFFING COSTS							
Team Member Last Name	Title/ Classification	Base Hourly Rate*	Overhead Rate (%)	Burdened Hourly Rate (Cx D)	Billing Rate (C+E)	Estimated Hours	Total Estimated Cost (DxE)
				\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00
				\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00
				\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00
				\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00
				\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00
				\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00
				\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00
TOTAL STAFFING COSTS							\$0.00

*Base Hourly Rates shall be quoted at cost, without overhead or profit.

Direct Expenses	
Type	Estimated Cost
Total Direct Expenses	\$0.00
FIRM FIXED FEE (PROFIT):	\$0.00
TOTAL ESTIMATED PRICE	\$0.00

Signature:	
Name:	
Title:	
Company Name:	
Date:	

Exhibit C – Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension & Other Responsibility Matters

This Certification is required to be submitted to NOACA on behalf of the principal bidder/proposer and all subcontractors whose subcontracts are reasonably anticipated to exceed \$25,000 in value.

- A. The undersigned Bidder/Proposer/Subcontractor ("Attester") certifies to the best of its knowledge and belief that the Attester and/or any of its principals or subcontractors:
1. Are not presently debarred, suspended, proposed for debarment, declared ineligible or voluntarily excluded from covered transactions by any Federal department or agency;
 2. Have not, within a three-year period preceding this bid/proposal, been convicted of or had a civil judgment rendered against them for commission of fraud or a criminal offense in connection with obtaining, attempting to obtain or performing a public (Federal, State or Local) transaction or contract or subcontract; violation of Federal or State antitrust statutes, or commission of embezzlement, theft, forgery, bribery, falsification or destruction of records, making false statements or receiving stolen property; and
 3. Are not presently indicted for or otherwise criminally or civilly charged by a governmental entity (Federal, State or local) with commission of any of the offenses enumerated in Paragraph 2 above; and
 4. Have not, within a three-year period preceding this bid/proposal, had one or more public transactions (Federal, State or local) terminated for cause or default by any federal, state or local agency.

"Principals" for the purposes of this certification, means officers, directors, owners, partners, and persons having primary management or supervisory responsibilities within a business entity (e.g., general manager, plant manager, head of a subsidiary, division, or business segment, and similar positions).

This certification concerns a matter which may be within the jurisdiction of an agency of the United States and the making of a false, fictitious, or fraudulent certification may render the maker subject to prosecution under Section 1001, Title 18, United States Code.

- B. The Attester shall provide immediate written notice to NOACA's Procurement Officer if, at any time, the Attester learns that its certification was erroneous when submitted or has become erroneous by reason of changed circumstances.
- C. A certification that any of the items in Paragraph A exists will not necessarily result in withholding of an award under this solicitation. However, the certification will be considered in connection with a determination of the Attester's responsibility. Failure of the Attester to furnish a certification or provide such additional information as requested by NOACA may render the Attester non-responsible, and the Attester shall not be considered for award.
- D. Nothing contained in the foregoing shall be construed to require establishment of a system of records in order to render, in good faith, the certification required by Paragraph A. The

knowledge and information of an Attester is not required to exceed that which is normally possessed by a prudent person in the ordinary course of business dealings.

- E. The certification in Paragraph A is a material representation of fact upon which reliance was placed when making award. If it is later determined that the Attester rendered an erroneous certification, in addition to other remedies available to NOACA, NOACA may terminate the contract resulting from this solicitation for default.

If the Attester is unable to attest to any of the statements in this certification, it shall attach an explanation.

THE UNDERSIGNED CERTIFIES OR AFFIRMS THE TRUTHFULNESS AND ACCURACY OF THE CONTENTS OF THE STATEMENTS SUBMITTED ON OR WITH THIS CERTIFICATION AND UNDERSTANDS THAT THE PROVISIONS OF [31 USC SECTIONS 3801 et seq.](#) ARE APPLICABLE THERETO.

Executed this ____ day of _____, 20__.

Name of Bidder/Proposer: _____

Address: _____

City, State, Zip: _____

Signature of Authorized Official: _____

Printed Name of Official _____ Title of Official _____

Telephone _____ Fax _____ E-Mail _____