NORTHEAST OHIO AREAWIDE COORDINATING AGENCY

MEMORANDUM

TO: Air Quality Subcommittee Members
   Samuel Alai, Mayor, City of Broadview Heights, Cuyahoga County
   Jeff Brandon, Trustee Chair, Montville Township
   Mark Alan Carpenter, P.E., District Environmental Coordinator, ODOT District 12
   James W. Dvorak, Commissioner, Geauga County
   Maribeth Feke, Director of Planning, Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority
   Tim Fischer, Manager of the Division of Air Pollution Control, Northeast District Office, Ohio EPA
   John R. Hamercheck, Commissioner, Lake County
   David G. Hearne, Interim Commissioner, Cleveland Division of Air Quality
   Lori Kokoski, Commissioner, Lorain County
   Bert Mechenbier, Air Pollution Control Supervisor, Lake County General Health District
   Sam Rubens, Administrator, Akron Regional Air Quality Management District
   Bryan Sokolowski, Chief of Air Monitoring, Cleveland Department of Public Health

FROM: David Hearne, Chair

DATE: March 13, 2020

RE: Air Quality Subcommittee
   Friday, March 20, 2020 from 9:00 a.m. to 10:30 a.m.
   NOACA Offices
   1299 Superior Avenue, Cleveland, Ohio

Please note that in addition to the members listed above, any interested Board members are welcome to attend.

I look forward to seeing you on Friday, March 20th at 9:00 a.m. at the NOACA offices.
AIR QUALITY SUBCOMMITTEE

1. Minutes of December 20, 2019, Meeting 1-1

2. Public Comments on Current Agenda Items Oral

3. Chair’s/Executive Director’s Report Oral

4. Action Items

5. Presentation / Discussion Items
   a. Future Action
      i. Air Quality Subcommittee Charter and Membership Review 5-1
      ii. NOACA Long Range Plan 5-5
   b. Information
      i. 2019 Subcommittee Focus Areas 5-7
      ii. Ohio EPA Workshop on 2015 Ozone Standard Nonattainment 5-9
      iii. Air Quality Public Education and Outreach 5-11
      iv. Gohio Commute Update and Performance Measures 5-13
      v. CY2020 Air Quality Forecast Accuracy (through February 29) 5-15
      vi. Air Quality Awareness Week 5-17
      vii. 2020 Commuter Choice Awards 5-19

6. Old Business

7. New Business

8. Adjournment

Next Meeting: Friday, June 19, 2020 – 9:00 a.m. - 10:30 a.m. NOACA Offices
Agenda Item No. 1

MINUTES
Present: Please see the attached attendance record.

Mr. Jeff Brandon, Chair of the Air Quality Subcommittee, convened the meeting at 9:02 a.m.

Meeting Minutes
A motion was made by Mr. Dave Schroedel to approve the minutes of the Air Quality Subcommittee meeting held on September 20, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. Nick Gorris. The motion passed by voice vote.

Public Comments
No public comments were made at this meeting.

Executive Director’s Report
Ms. Grace Gallucci thanked members for their service and said she looked forward to working with them in 2020.

Mr. Brandon commented that he looked forward to another good year.

ACTION ITEMS
No action items were presented at this meeting.

PRESENTATION / DISCUSSION ITEMS

Air Quality Public Education and Outreach Strategy Update
Ms. Mara Caputo stated that NOACA has worked with the Markey Group over the past two years to develop the Air Quality Public Education and Outreach Strategy and Communication Plan.

Ms. Caputo reviewed the following:

- Strategy Document Outline – Action Plan that includes the following goals:
  - Goal #1: Increase awareness of the air quality challenge in Northeast Ohio
  - Goal #2: Educate the community on the causes and potential solutions for the air quality challenge in Northeast Ohio
  - Goal #3: Empower employers, healthcare providers, and educational institutions with resources to be air quality champions
  - Goal #4: Promote a culture at NOACA that better integrates air quality with other programs
Goal #5: Promote strategies outside of NOACA to change transportation and infrastructure policy and increase clean air funding

- Draft Communication Plan (audiences)
- Best opportunities for NOACA to reach audiences
- Key points
- Five products incorporated into the 2020 Overall Work Plan (products and intended outcomes)

Ms. Caputo stated that NOACA will continue the implementation of the Air Quality Public Education and Outreach Strategy and Communication Plan and update the Air Quality Subcommittee on the progress.

**Gohio Commute Update and Performance Measures**

Mr. Tim Kovach provided background on Gohio Commute and performance measures. He stated that staff created performance measures to track the progress of Gohio Commute using the following categories: user metrics, outreach and promotion metrics, systemwide performance metrics and platform administration and enhancement metrics.

Mr. Kovach stated that the user and systemwide metrics were as follows through November 30, 2019:

- Total users: 6,546
- Total trips (all modes): 86,086
- Total non-SOV trips: 74,410
- Total VMT avoided: 749,440
- Total calories burned: 8,910,927
- CO₂ avoided: 201.5 metric tons
- CO avoided: 2.46 metric tons
- NOₓ avoided: 451.08 kg
- VOCs avoided: 107.75 kg
- PM₂.₅ avoided: 25.46 kg

Mr. Kovach stated that 54 organizations have created subsites on Gohio Commute, bringing the total number of subsites/networks on the platform to 94. He mentioned that the platform administration and enhancement metrics include 21 total challenges, 49 employer/organization incentives and 111 total events.

Mr. Kovach stated that the results of the 2nd annual Lake “Eerie” Bike Challenge were as follows:

- Participants: 95 (+20%)
- Trips: 1,818 (+34%)
- Miles: 11,738 (+42%)
- Money Saved: $6,644 (+42%)
- Calories Burned: 586,891 (+42%)
- CO₂ Saved: 4.76 tons (+42%)

Mr. Kovach stated that staff will continue to promote Gohio Commute to interested organizations; work with RideAmigos to improve the platform, launch the Specialized Mobility Search function; and create new events on the platform.

**CY 2019 Air Quality Forecast Accuracy through November 30, 2019**

Mr. Joe MacDonald stated that NOACA forecasts daily peak eight-hour ground-level ozone concentrations and fine particulate matter concentrations. In 2019, daily forecasts for ozone began on March 1 and concluded on October 31, while daily forecasts for fine particulate matter
are year-round. NOACA posts daily air quality forecasts through AirNowTech, in affiliation with the United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA).

Mr. MacDonald stated that NOACA’s ground-level ozone (O₃) and fine particulate matter (PM₂.₅) forecasts are based on a review of several meteorological variables and model guidance.

Mr. MacDonald reviewed the 2019 PM₂.₅ forecast performance for the NOACA region. He stated that NOACA’s forecasts for good/moderate threshold were correct 65% of the time and the forecasts for moderate/unhealthy threshold were correct 99.5% of the time.

Mr. MacDonald stated that NOACA had one missed opportunity on November 19 and one false alarm on November 20 for PM₂.₅ exceedance.

Mr. MacDonald stated that the forecast performance of ozone was as follows for the period of March 1 - October 31, 2019:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Threshold</th>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>50 ppb</th>
<th>70 ppb</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NOACA</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>98%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NOAA (6Z/12Z)</td>
<td>(83/84)%</td>
<td>(97/97)%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mr. MacDonald reviewed missed opportunities and false alarms of ozone exceedance days for NOACA and NOAA for the period of March 1 - October 31, 2019. For missed opportunities, NOACA and NOAA did not forecast observed categorical exceedance of 2015 8-hour ozone standard (70 ppb) for three (3) days; NOACA and NOAA both missed one (1) day. For false alarms, NOAA forecasted four (4) days of categorical exceedance of 2015 8-hour standard (70 ppb) when observed concentrations did not exceed, while NOACA forecasted two (2) days.

Mr. MacDonald stated that NOACA staff will continue to track the forecast performance of ozone for NOACA and NOAA; track the forecast performance of particulate matter for NOACA only; collaborate with NOAA personnel to report model performance in Northeast Ohio; and provide an update at the Air Quality Subcommittee meeting in March 2020.

Mr. Brandon asked if the region is doing better or worse when it comes to cleaner air given that there were 6 exceedance days this year.

Mr. MacDonald stated that air continues to improve in the NOACA region. However, EPA continues to tighten the standard. The ozone standard of 70 ppb has only been in effect since 2015, prior to that it was 75 ppb. The region continues to be in nonattainment of that standard. Mr. Brandon said overall that is good news.

Update on the Signal Timing and Optimization Program (STOP)

Mr. Brian Blayney provided an update on STOP. He mentioned that a request for proposal (RFP) was released, six proposals were submitted to NOACA, and the selection committee chose Albeck Gerken, Inc. to do the signal timing work. He noted, however, that Albeck Gerken was acquired by Iteris. NOACA’s contract will be with Iteris, but NOACA staff will continue to work with the Albeck Gerken team. Mr. Blayney reviewed the following:

- Current project - Chester / Euclid Corridor
• Draft results - Phase 2 (emission savings - 2,500 metric tons; fuel savings of 283,300
gallons; delay savings - 344,000 hours; and benefit cost ratio 14:1.

Mr. Blayney stated that projects will be completed using CMAQ funding allocated in the 2020
and 2021 Overall Work Programs (OWPs). He noted that next year’s project will commence
on or around January 1, 2020 and will be completed by January 2021, and Part II, if the option
is authorized, will commence by January 2021 at locations to be determined.

Mr. Blayney stated that with recent Board approval, NOACA will enter into a contract with Iteris,
Inc. at an amount not to exceed $439,438 for Part I of NOACA’s two-year Signal Timing and
Optimization Program (STOP). NOACA’s Executive Director is authorized to execute the option
for Part II. Mr. Blayney stated that staff will work with the local communities involved and the
consultant team to implement STOP.

Ms. Gallucci stated that the benefit cost ratio of 14:1 is not as good as some of the others in the
past. She asked if this is the worst NOACA has seen. Mr. Blayney said it was the lowest benefit
cost ratio of STOP. Ms. Gallucci asked if the consultants can break it down into what the impact
would be for an individual driver so they know how much they will save in emissions and what
will be their specific delay time savings. She said she would be curious as to what she has done
for emissions.

Mr. Blayney stated that John Albeck is planning to show a video of the change in travel time at
the Board meeting in March. Mr. Blayney said he saw the preliminary version of that for a 15-
minute trip and the savings were about 2 minutes in the peak hour.

Ms. Gallucci asked Mr. Blayney to have the consultant come up with a graphic specific to an
individual so a person can relate to it more.

Ms. Gallucci stated that STOP continues to be an exciting worthwhile program and 14:1 is still
good.

Mr. Schroedel asked if the plan is to take what NOACA has learned from the projects and develop
guidelines for communities to do improvements along their corridors. He said the guidelines will
help communities time their signals more efficiently.

Ms. Gallucci stated that the program is geared toward specific corridors. She noted that
Mr. Schroedel’s suggestion is excellent. She said staff can pull the data and summarize or
synthesize the data and come up with guidelines and recommendations.

2019 Transportation for Livable Communities Initiative (TLCI) Program Application
Update
Mr. Jim Thompson provided background on the TLCI program. He stated that NOACA received
20 requests for the current round: four competitive planning studies and 16 implementation
projects. He mentioned that applicants presented their implementation projects to NOACA staff
on October 23-24, 2019.

Mr. Thompson stated that the annual budget for the TLCI program is $2 million (up to $500,000
for planning studies and the remainder for implementation projects). He provided an overview
of the planning studies and implementation projects. For planning studies, the total requested
amount for NOACA’s three regional studies is $600,000; the total requested amount for the other
studies submitted this round is $476,000; and the total requested amount for the implementation projects is $4.8 million.

Mr. Thompson stated that staff will present recommendations to the Planning and Programming Committee in January 2020. He said the Board of Directors is anticipated to make final recommendations at its meeting in March 2020.

**ACTIVATE Survey (Bike and Pedestrian Planning) Overview**
Ms. Katie Sieb stated that NOACA is currently working on its Regional Pedestrian and Bicycle Plan and the process and output of that plan is called ACTIVATE. Ms. Sieb announced that a survey has been launched and can be found at NOACA.org/ACTIVATE. She invited members to take the survey and asked them to share the survey link with people in their networks.

Mr. Brandon talked about how mountain biking is becoming very popular and noted that there is a biking trail in one of the parks in Montville Township.

**Old Business**
No old business was discussed at this meeting.

**New Business**
No new business was discussed at this meeting.

**Adjournment**
The next Air Quality Subcommittee meeting will be held at the NOACA offices on March 20, 2020 at 9:00 a.m. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 9:55 a.m.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MEETING DATES</th>
<th>03/15/19</th>
<th>06/21/19</th>
<th>09/20/19</th>
<th>12/20/19</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Samuel Alai – Mayor of Broadview Heights (David Schroedel, Alternate)</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeff Brandon, Montville Township (Adam Friedrick, Alternate)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Alan Carpenter, ODOT District 12 (Thomas Sorge, Alternate)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James W. Dvorak, Geauga County Commissioner Nicholas Gorris, Alternate</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maribeth Feke, Planning Director, GCRTA</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tim Fischer, Ohio EPA (Corey Kurjian, Alternate)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John R. Hamercheck, Lake County Commissioner (Daniel J. Gerson, Alternate)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David G. Hearne, Cleveland Department of Public Health</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lori Kokoski, Commissioner (Robert Klaiber, Alternate)</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bert Mechenbier – Lake County General Health District</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bryan Sokolowski Cleveland Division of Air Quality</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam Rubens, Akron Regional Air Quality Management District</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

X - Member present  
A - Alternate present
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MEMBER</th>
<th>SIGNATURE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Samuel Alai – Mayor of Broadview Heights (David Schroedel, Alternate)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeff Brandon – Montville Township (Adam Friedrick, Alternate)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Alan Carpenter, ODOT District 12 (Thomas Sorge, Alternate)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James W. Dvorak – Geauga County Commissioner (Nicholas Gorris, Alternate)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maribeth Feke – GCRTA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tim Fischer – Ohio EPA (Corey Kurjian, Alternate)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John R. Hamercheck – Lake County Commissioner (Daniel J. Gerson, Alternate)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David G. Hearne, Interim Air Quality Commissioner, Cleveland Department of Public Health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lori Kokoski – Lorain County Commissioner (Robert Klaber, Alternate)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bert Mechenbier – Lake County Gen Health District</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam Rubens – Akron Regional Air Quality Management District</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bryan Sokolowski – Cleveland Division of Air Quality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Agenda Item No. 2

PUBLIC COMMENTS
Agenda Item No. 3

CHAIR/EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT
Agenda Item No. 4

ACTION ITEMS
Agenda Item No. 7

PRESENTATION/DISCUSSION ITEMS
MEMORANDUM

TO: NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee
FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director
DATE: March 13, 2020
RE: Air Quality Subcommittee Charter and Membership Review

ACTION REQUESTED
No action is requested at this time. This item is for information and presentation only.

BACKGROUND/JUSTIFICATION FOR CURRENT ACTION
In 2014, following the update to NOACA’s code of regulations, the Air Quality Subcommittee was formed to provide advice and policy recommendations to the Planning and Programming Committee with regard to air quality environmental planning. The Charter and membership have not been reviewed since establishing the Subcommittee. During the March meeting, staff will present history, background and potential revisions to the charter and membership. Attached are the current charter and membership.

FINANCIAL IMPACT
There is no financial impact for this decision.

CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS
Revisions suggested by the Subcommittee will be presented at the April Planning and Programming Committee meeting.

GG/ks/8508c
NOACA AIR QUALITY SUBCOMMITTEE CHARTER

PURPOSE: The Air Quality Subcommittee shall provide advice and policy recommendations to the Planning and Programming Committee with regard to air quality environmental planning.

GOALS: The goal of the Air Quality Subcommittee is to advance the agency’s efforts regarding air quality.

FUNCTIONS: The Air Quality Subcommittee will:
- Provide advice and policy recommendations on air quality environmental and air quality issues and transportation projects with related air quality issues;
- Assist the Planning and Programming Committee and Agency staff in identifying significant environmental problems, priorities, and concerns with development of a comprehensive regional approach to environmental and air quality concerns;
- Review and provide recommendations to the Planning and Programming Committee and Agency staff to advance Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) projects through the statewide committee;
- Assist the Planning and Programming Committee and Agency staff in environmental and air quality work program development; and
- Serve in such other capacities as the Planning and Programming Committee and Board of Directors may determine.

MEMBERSHIP: The Air Quality Subcommittee shall consist of the following 11 voting members:
1. Five members of the Board of Directors with at least one Board member from jurisdictions within each member county [5].
2. One representative of the City of Cleveland [1].
3. One member from each of the local air agencies (Cleveland Division of Air Quality, Lake County General Health District, and the Akron Regional Air Quality Management District) [3].
4. The Ohio Department of Transportation, District 12 [1].
5. The Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority [1].
6. The Ohio EPA Northeast District Office chief or their designated representative, who shall be a non-voting member.
7. The United States EPA District 5 designated representative, who shall be a non-voting member.

REPORTING RELATIONSHIP: The Air Quality Subcommittee reports to the Planning and Programming Committee.

MEETINGS: The Subcommittee will hold regular meetings on a quarterly basis. Special meetings may be called as needed. A majority of Subcommittee members (6) shall constitute a quorum to transact business.
AGENDA AND MINUTES:

NOACA staff will work with the chair to develop agendas for meetings, which will be sent to subcommittee members at least 7 days in advance of the meeting. Minutes will be approved by subcommittee members at the following meeting.

STAFFING:

Agency staff shall provide the Subcommittee with administrative and technical support as requested by the chair.
MEMORANDUM

TO: NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee
FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director
DATE: March 13, 2020
RE: NOACA Long Range Plan

ACTIONS REQUESTED
Provide input into the development of the long-range plan (LRP).

BACKGROUND
The Long Range Plan promotes quality of life through integrated regional land use, housing, transportation, and capital investment planning to enhance the region’s economic competitiveness, increase its resilience, provide its citizens better access to affordable housing, and offer more cost-effective, sustainable transportation choices. The Long Range Transportation Plan, a component of the Long Range Plan, will study and plan for future transportation systems.

The new LRP will support the vision and goals for the NOACA region, and identify all of the improvements scheduled for funding over the next 20 years. The agency must adopt a new LRP by June 2021.

The LRP is in preliminary development, and staff will seek input from Air Quality Subcommittee members.

FINANCIAL IMPACT
There is no financial impact.

CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS
Staff will continue to work with the committee during 2020 to develop various sections of the LRP.

GG/ks/8509c
TO: NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee

FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director

DATE: March 13, 2020

RE: Air Quality Subcommittee Focus Areas for 2020

ACTION REQUESTED
No action is requested at this time. This item is for information and presentation only.

BACKGROUND/JUSTIFICATION FOR CURRENT ACTION
As the parent Committee to the Air Quality Subcommittee, The Planning and Programming Committee discussed and approved the Subcommittee focus areas for 2020 at its January meeting. The focus areas are:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2020 Focus Areas</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Air quality education and outreach program implementation</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signal Timing Optimization Program (STOP)</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policies and Strategies to Manage Urban Sprawl</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Range Transportation Plan</td>
<td>New for 2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FINANCIAL IMPACT
There is no financial impact for this decision.

CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS
Meeting agendas and materials will be crafted to accomplish the identified focus areas for the Subcommittees.

GG/ks/8510c
TO: NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee

FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director

DATE: March 13, 2020

RE: Ohio EPA Workshop on 2015 Ozone Standard Nonattainment

ACTION REQUESTED
No action is requested at this time. This item is included for information and presentation only.

BACKGROUND
The Ohio Environmental Protection Agency (Ohio EPA) convened a meeting of stakeholders on Tuesday, February 25. Their purpose was to provide an update on current air quality data and upcoming regulatory requirements under the 2015 ground-level ozone (O3) National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) of 70 parts per billion (ppb). Ohio EPA also hoped to open a discussion on potential strategies to improve air quality in Northeast Ohio. Chief Bob Hodanbosi, Ohio EPA Division of Air Pollution Control, provided an overview of federal regulations around O3, including Northeast Ohio’s 2015 NAAQS attainment status. He explained that the United States Environmental Protection Agency (US EPA) designated Cincinnati, Cleveland, and Columbus as marginal nonattainment areas for the 2015 NAAQS on August 3, 2018. While Columbus became the first area redesignated from nonattainment to maintenance status on August 21, 2019, both Cincinnati and Cleveland remain in nonattainment.

Cleveland must attain the 2015 NAAQS by August 3, 2021. Because that date falls in the middle of the 2021 O3 season (March 1 – October 31), 2020 is the last season from which U.S. EPA will use data to determine compliance. As a marginal nonattainment area, Cleveland would not need to implement additional emissions control measures (ECMs); however, the region is not currently on track to achieve the standard by the attainment date. Both the Mayfield (71 ppb) and Eastlake (73 ppb) monitors have 2017-2019 fourth highest 8-hour average O3 values above the standard. In order for Mayfield and Eastlake to meet the 2015 NAAQS, their fourth highest 8-hour average O3 values could not exceed 68 ppb and 66 ppb, respectively. Unfortunately, the Eastlake monitor’s lowest fourth-highest 8-hour average O3 value on record was 70 ppb in 2013. According to Chief Hodanbosi, the most likely outcome is for U.S. EPA to “bump-up” Cleveland’s nonattainment status from marginal to moderate. This action would extend the attainment date by three years, but it would also trigger additional requirements under the Clean Air Act.

Assistant Chief Jennifer Van Vlerah, Ohio EPA Division of Air Pollution Control, explained that “bump-up” decisions are required within six (6) months of the attainment date, or February 3, 2022. At that point, Cleveland would need to meet the 2015 NAAQS by August 3, 2024. She noted that, in the past, Ohio EPA has primarily relied on federal ECMs in its State Implementation Plans (SIPs), which outline how the state’s nonattainment areas will attain and maintain the NAAQS. However, she explained that current federal ECMs are not sufficient for Cleveland, and she does not anticipate any additional federal actions to restrict emissions
of O₃ precursor pollutants – nitrogen oxides (NOₓ) and volatile organic compounds (VOCs). Accordingly, Ohio EPA must now consider what additional local or statewide ECMs it may need to implement in Cleveland. Statewide controls allow Ohio EPA to avoid complaints about ECM implementation only in certain areas (such as E-Check), but it invites complaints from areas in attainment that must also apply these new controls.

Emissions come from both stationary sources and mobile sources. Stationary sources include both point sources (large facilities with individually significant emissions) and nonpoint sources (small but numerous facilities with collectively significant emissions). Mobile sources include both on-road sources (e.g. cars, trucks, buses) and off-road sources (aircraft, lawnmowers, construction/farm equipment). Assistant Chief Van Vlerah outlined the primary sources of NOₓ and VOCs in the Cleveland area, using data from the 2014 National Emissions Inventory (NEI) for all sources and data on stationary point sources from 2018. She explained that mobile sources account for 60% of NOₓ emissions in Cleveland. NOₓ emissions from stationary point sources fell by 53% in the Cleveland area from 2014 to 2018, further illustrating the importance of mobile sources in reducing O₃ levels in the region. Assistant Chief Van Vlerah indicated that Cleveland gets a greater O₃ benefit from reducing a ton of NOₓ than from reducing a ton of VOCs. The majority (53%) of VOCs in Northeast Ohio come from stationary nonpoint sources.

While Ohio EPA has previously focused on emissions reductions from stationary sources, that option is no longer sufficient to meet the 2015 NAAQS; neither are short-term ECMs. Accordingly, the Agency intends to explore longer-term actions more focused on mobile source emissions reductions. Akron METRO asked about Ohio House Resolution 247, which calls for the elimination of E-Check. Chief Hodanbosi clarified that the Resolution is a nonbinding request to Congress and U.S. EPA to amend the Clean Air Act to remove the requirements to implement vehicle inspection and maintenance programs, like E-Check. Because the resolution has no direct impact, and Ohio EPA relies on E-Check to meet NAAQS requirements in Northeast Ohio, Ohio EPA will continue to implement E-Check until it is told otherwise. Multiple attendees asked questions about funding for alternative fuel vehicles, including the Volkswagen settlement’s electric vehicle (EV) infrastructure set-aside, the Diesel Emissions Reduction Grant (DERG), and the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) program. Ohio EPA admitted that it had not done much work on EVs, but staff are open to explore priority vehicle funding to nonattainment areas.

**FINANCIAL IMPACT**

There is no financial impact.

**CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS**

NOACA staff will continue to work with Ohio EPA to identify new options to reduce mobile emissions in the Cleveland nonattainment area. Staff will also continue to discuss the potential of transportation control measure (TCM) implementation, similar to other regions with longstanding O₃ nonattainment issues. TCMs may include, but are not limited to: additional funding for alternative fuel vehicles, park-n-ride lots, active transportation infrastructure, high-occupancy vehicle (HOV) lanes, and trip reduction ordinances (TROs).
NORTHEAST OHIO AREA WIDE COORDINATING AGENCY

MEMORANDUM

TO: NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee

FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director

DATE: March 13, 2020

RE: Update on Development of Air Quality Implementation Strategy

ACTION REQUESTED
No action is requested at this time. This item is for information only.

BACKGROUND
In June 2017, the NOACA Board approved a contract with Markey Group, a communications consulting firm, to develop an Air Quality Public Education and Outreach Strategy and accompanying Communications Plan. These documents will guide NOACA’s air quality public outreach activities over the next 5-10 years. Most importantly, these documents will guide implementation of NOACA’s Regional Strategic Plan, and help bring the region into compliance with the United States Environmental Protection Agency’s (U.S. EPA’s) National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS).

The Strategy identifies gaps in existing air quality programming in the region and will engage the community (individuals, employers, health care organizations, and educational institutions) in actions aimed to improve air quality through their implementation. The Communication Plan, in conjunction with the Strategy, provides specific direction to NOACA staff regarding air quality messaging to the public – via NOACA’s website, social media, special events, paid advertising, and other forms of communication.

The final drafts of the documents were presented during the September 2019 AQS meeting.

NOACA staff will introduce work products related to the Strategy and Plan as well as relevant progress:

1. Create a user-friendly definition of clean air and survey the general public to measure awareness
2. Create a group of aligned entities and develop a “Don’t Idle” campaign to explain the linkage between air quality and transportation and promote behavior change
3. Develop relationships with influencers in the local media
4. Create a media campaign to promote Gohio Commute and the Commuter Choice Awards
5. Foster collaboration between the Air Quality and Safe Routes to School Initiative

FINANCIAL IMPACT
There is no financial impact
CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS
NOACA staff will continue to provide updates on pertinent information regarding the Air Quality Public Education and Outreach Strategy Implementation Work Plan.

GG/mc/8512c
MEMORANDUM

TO: NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee

FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director

DATE: March 13, 2020

RE: Gohio Commute Update and Performance Measures

ACTION REQUESTED
No action requested. This item is included for information and presentation only.

BACKGROUND/INFORMATION
In partnership with the six (6) other largest Metropolitan Planning Organizations (MPOs) in Ohio, NOACA manages Gohio Commute, a multi-regional transportation demand management (TDM) platform. Gohio Commute, which launched in April 2017, serves as a one-stop-shop trip planner for the NOACA region, with connectivity throughout Ohio. NOACA has worked to engage businesses, local governments, colleges, and other organizations to create their own subsites through the platform. These subsites enable organizations to offer their employees (or students) targeted incentives to choose healthier, more efficient modes of transportation.

In order to evaluate the success of Gohio Commute, NOACA staff have developed a set of performance measures, which they track on a regular basis. These performance measures fall within four categories:

1. User Metrics (e.g. number of registered users, number of logged trips)
2. Outreach and Promotion Metrics (e.g. number of Gohio Commute workshops, number of subsites created)
3. Systemwide Performance Metrics (e.g. number of non-drive alone trips logged, amount of carbon dioxide (CO₂) saved)
4. Platform Administration and Enhancement Metrics (e.g. number of map layers added, number of events created)

From December 1, 2019, through February 29, 2020, 112 new users joined Gohio Commute from the NOACA region, bringing the total number of users to 6,658. During the previous three months, users in the NOACA region logged over 5,536 trips, of which 94.6% were via alternative modes. This count brings the total number of alternative trips to nearly 80,000 since the platform launched. Gohio Commute users saved more than $25,000 in commute costs and 20 metric tons of CO₂ emissions during this period (nearly $284,000 and over 222 metric tons of CO₂ saved since 2017).
There are currently 110 subsites in the NOACA region, representing 57 different organizations. Moreover, users have created 22 challenges, 52 incentives, and 124 events on the platform.

**FINANCIAL IMPACT**
NOACA will spend $7,500 on Gohio Commute during FY2020. Compared to OhioRideshare, the agency will accrue a net savings in operational costs of about $4,000 per year.

**CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS**
Staff will continue to promote Gohio Commute to interested organizations. Staff will also continue to work with RideAmigos to make additions/improvements to the user experience.

GG/tk/8513c
TO: NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee

FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director

DATE: March 13, 2020

RE: CY 2020 Air Quality Forecast Accuracy (through February 29)

ACTION REQUESTED
No action requested. This item is included for information and presentation only.

BACKGROUND/INFORMATION
Each year, NOACA forecasts daily peak eight-hour ground-level ozone concentrations and fine particulate matter concentrations. In 2020, daily forecasts for ozone will begin March 1 and will conclude October 31, while daily forecasts for fine particulate matter continue year-round. NOACA posts daily air quality forecasts through AirNowTech, in affiliation with the United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA).

AirNowTech statistics show that NOACA staff categorical forecasts of fine particulate matter for CY 2020 (through February 29) were 67% accurate (Good/Moderate threshold (12.5µm)) and 100% accurate (Moderate/Unhealthy for Sensitive Groups (USG) threshold (35µm)).

For 2020, NOACA staff will provide NOAA personnel forecast verification statistics on NOAA model performance throughout the ozone season (March 1-October 31). NOACA staff will also monitor its own forecast performance and collaborate with others to improve.

FINANCIAL IMPACT
There is no financial impact.

CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS
Staff will consult and update the Air Quality Subcommittee throughout this process.
TO: NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee
FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director
DATE: March 13, 2020
RE: Air Quality Awareness Week 2020

ACTION REQUESTED
No action is requested at this time. This item is included for information and presentation only.

BACKGROUND
A number of activities are carried out to promote air quality awareness in our region and encourage participation in the Gohio Commute platform.

The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA) and several partner federal agencies have designated the week of May 4-8 as Air Quality Awareness Week 2020. This year’s theme is Better Air, Better Health! The goal is to promote activities and events that increase air quality awareness and encourage people to check the Air Quality Index (AQI) daily. This year’s theme is also associated with the broader effort of celebrating various EPA achievements. “Improving Our Nation’s Air” is the celebrated achievement for May, similar to last year, NOACA will collaborate with other Ohio metropolitan planning organizations (MPOs) to develop daily messaging and promotional activities to educate the public about air quality in our communities.

FINANCIAL IMPACT
There is no financial impact.

CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS
NOACA staff will continue to update the subcommittee on air quality awareness.

GG/mc/8515c
MEMORANDUM

TO: NOACA Air Quality Subcommittee
FROM: Grace Gallucci, Executive Director
DATE: March 13, 2020
RE: 2020 Commuter Choice Awards

ACTION REQUESTED
No action is requested at this time. This item is included for information and presentation only.

BACKGROUND
Since 2014, NOACA’s Commuter Choice Awards have annually recognized organizations in Northeast Ohio that promote alternative transportation modes and foster behavioral change in their employees’ commute choices. NOACA and its partners award top employers with Gold, Silver, or Bronze ratings based on employer support (policies, facilities, and incentives), employer location, and employee behavior. NOACA also recognizes “best in category” winners: large business, small business, large government entity or non-profit, small government entity or non-profit.

NOACA staff are now actively planning the 2020 Commuter Choice Awards. Similar to last year’s program, NOACA and its partners will strongly encourage participating organizations and their employees to compete in a friendly month-long competition on the Gohio Commute platform. NOACA staff will measure and rank actual commuter behavior at each organization. Organizations whose employees log the most alternative commutes in a month, on a per capita basis, will earn points to boost their overall score. NOACA staff anticipate that this challenge will take place during the month of August.

Staff will determine partner organizations with NOACA to sponsor this year’s awards and provide prizes to winners. In addition, staff propose the creation of a second tier of “community partners” to help promote Gohio Commute subsite creation and the awards to potential applicants, but without the financial commitment expected from our primary sponsors. Staff hopes this will help NOACA grow the number of applicants and subsite creation in 2020.

NOACA will send out the 2020 Commuter Choice Awards invite letters in late spring, along with a survey that employers must complete to compete. In August (most likely), staff will administer and monitor the month-long challenge. In late summer or early fall, NOACA and its partners will calculate scores and choose winners. NOACA will likely distribute awards at the Annual Meeting in October.

FINANCIAL IMPACT
There is no financial impact.

CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS
NOACA staff will provide updates on the 2020 Commuter Choice Awards as they develop.

gg/mc/8516c
Agenda Item No. 6

OLD BUSINESS
Agenda Item No. 7

NEW BUSINESS
Agenda Item No. 8

ADJOURN