

**NOACA Transportation Control Measure Evaluation Matrix**  
**NAQPATF Meeting**  
**October 27, 2005**  
**DRAFT**

Potential Emission Reduction Strategies 2009	Quantifiable	Enforceable	VOC/HC Tons/Day Eliminated	NOx Tons/Day Eliminated	Health Benefits	Economic Benefits or Detriments	Other Benefits or Detriments	Costs/Ton	Other Costs	Technically Possible	Successful Implementation Elsewhere	Requires State or Local Legislation/Rules	Requires Behavioral Change	Requires Economic Investment	2009 Timing	Short/Long-Term Planning	Comments
From RVP 9.0 to 7.8 Nonattainment Area (8 Counties)	Yes	Yes	5.25	0.32					1.0 Cents/gal refinery	Yes	Cin/Day OH	Yes			Yes	Short	Availability?
From RVP 9.0 to 7.0 NonAttainment Area (8 Counties)	Yes	Yes	8.20	0.48					0.6-3.0 Cents/gal refinery	Yes	Detroit	Yes			Yes	Short	Availability?
From RVP 9.0 to RFG NonAttainment Area (8 Counties)	Yes	Yes	11.22	0.13					1.7-6.2 Cents/gal refinery	Yes	Chicago	Yes	Refinery Investment		?	Long	Availability?
From RVP 9.0 to 7.8 NOACA Area (5 Counties)	Yes	Yes	3.30	0.20													
From RVP 9.0 to 7.0 NOACA Area (5 Counties)	Yes	Yes	5.30	0.30													
From RVP 9.0 to RFG NOACA Area (5 Counties)	Yes	Yes	7.40	0.10													
From RVP 9.0 to 7.8 AMATs Area (2 Counties)	Yes	Yes	1.61	0.11													
From RVP 9.0 to 7.0 AMATs Area (2 Counties)	Yes	Yes	2.40	0.16													
From RVP 9.0 to RFG AMATS Area (2 Counties)	Yes	Yes	3.13	0.03													
From RVP 9.0 to 7.8 Ashtabula County	Yes	Yes	0.34	0.00													
From RVP 9.0 to 7.0 Ashtabula County	Yes	Yes	0.50	0.02													
From RVP 9.0 to RFG Ashtabula County	Yes	Yes	0.68	0.00													
From RVP 9.0 to 7.8 Stark Mahoning Trumbull*	Yes	Yes	1.43	0.09													
From RVP 9.0 to 7.0 Stark Mahoning Trumbull*	Yes	Yes	2.30	0.13													
From RVP 9.0 to 7.8 Nonattainment Area & Stark Mahoning Trumbull*	Yes	Yes	6.68	0.40													
From RVP 9.0 to 7.0 Nonattainment Area & Stark Mahoning Trumbull*	Yes	Yes	10.50	0.61													
From 65 MPH to 55 MPH - 5 County NOACA	Yes	Yes	-1.00	2.00						Yes	Houston	Yes			Yes	Short	
From 55 MPH to 65 MPH - 5 County NOACA																	

\*Benefits may not directly benefit nonattainment area. Data was estimated and not model derived.

**NOACA Transportation Control Measure Evaluation Matrix**  
**NAQPATF Meeting**  
**October 27, 2005**  
**DRAFT**

Potential Emission Reduction Strategies 2009	Quantifiable	Enforceable	VOC/HC Tons/Day Eliminated	NOx Tons/Day Eliminated	Health Benefits	Economic Benefits or Detriments	Other Benefits or Detriments	Costs/Ton	Other Costs	Technically Possible	Successful Implementation Elsewhere	Requires State or Local Legislation/Rules	Requires Behavioral Change	Requires Economic Investment	2009 Timing	Short/Long-Term Planning	Comments
No I/M Program - 5 County NOACA			-3.60	-4.53													
Current I/M Program to Most Stringent - 5-County NOACA	Yes	Yes	3.18	1.09						Yes	Hypothetical\	Yes			Yes	Short	
Current I/M Program to ASM 2525 Final OBD - 5-County NOACA	Yes	Yes	0.31	0.43													
Change Current Waiver Rate 3% Pre-1997 & 1% Post 1996 to 0%	Yes	Yes	0.03	0.03													
I/M Enhancements - Autos = Decrease in the Exemption Yrs																	
I/M Enhancements - Trucks = More Stringent NOx Cutpoints																	
Roadside Testing - Diesel Trucks																	
Trip Reduction Program - 10% Trips Use Transit			1.62	4.14													
Trip Reduction Program - 10% of Workers Work at Home			0.47	0.57													
Trip Reduction Program - 10% Trips Use Transit & 10% Workers Work at Home			2.12	4.63													

\*Benefits may not directly benefit nonattainment area. Data was estimated and not model derived.

	HC	NOX
<b>Current I/M Emissions</b>	33.10	42.50
<b>Most Stringent I/M Program</b>	30.80	41.39



